Gender Mainstreaming Calls for Gender Breakdowns

Case Study: The Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor

Barbara Swirski
November 2011
A New Strategy: Gender Mainstreaming

Gender mainstreaming is a new approach to designing and assessing government and municipal activities. This approach increases transparency and ensures that public activities are designed to address the differential needs of women and men. The system was developed by gender expert Gertrude Aström from Sweden, who visited Israel in June 2011 and was a guest of the Ministry of Finance and the Knesset.

The system of gender mainstreaming was adopted by the Swedish government in 1994, and later by the European Union, which endorsed it as the preferred way to promote gender equality. It was also adopted by the OECD (Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development), which obliged member states to incorporate it by 2015. Israel has been a member of the OECD since May 2010.

Gender mainstreaming entails a new way of thinking about the differences between women and men (and between girls and boys) – their behaviors, roles, and needs – every time a program or a budget is designed or assessed. Some examples illustrate these differences:

- In the summer of 2011, an article appeared in The Marker headlined: “The best boys do physics, the best girls do not.” The article reported that even though high school girls do as well in physics as the boys, few chose to study this subject at the university level.

- Sports for men and boys were found to enjoy a greater subsidy than sports for women and girls – both at the national and local level – wherever this was investigated.

- The Israel welfare reform program, known as the “Wisconsin Plan,” was designed as if it served men and women equally, although most participants (65 percent) were actually women – see the analysis by the Women’s Budget Forum (http://wbf.org.il/uploaded/wisconsin_heb_1.pdf). Had the gender composition of the target population been taken into account from the outset, the program might have been better adapted for women and been more successful.

- Studies in Sweden found that the criteria for receiving home healthcare assistance are more stringent for women than for men. It can be assumed that the situation in Israel is no different.

What is required for gender mainstreaming? Firstly, an interest on the part of the Ministry to work toward gender equality and the will to promote it. Second, gender mainstreaming requires data disaggregated by gender about those who receive services, potentially and actually, and about those who provide them.

The Situation in the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor

A gender analysis cannot be performed on the work of the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor because not all the departments collect data by gender. The only department that serves both men and women and collects data by gender (and nationality) is the Vocational Training Department, which began to collect gender data as a result of several programs designed for women. Subsequently, gender data were collected for all the programs, including those serving both men and women.

The Ministry does collect data for programs serving women, or primarily women, such as the Department for Women’s Employment. However, the strategy of gender mainstreaming requires that gender data be collected in all departments, not just those targeting women or men. This pertains, of course, to most departments in most government ministries.

It should be noted that the failure to collect data by gender is in violation of the law: An amendment to the Statistics Law from 2008 requires that all data collected by government bodies and subsidiary units be broken down by gender.

In the absence of data disaggregated by gender, and out of a desire to promote a gender analysis of state programs and budgets, this document highlights areas in which data should be collected by gender and the benefits that could be derived from such data.

The departments addressed in this paper are: the Investment Promotion Center; the Office of the Chief Scientist; the Regulation and Enforcement [of Labor Laws] Division; programs to encourage the employment of single parents, 45+ year-olds, and Ethiopian Israelis; the Regional Development Center; and the Vocational Training Department. In each of these departments, interviews
Gender Mainstreaming

were conducted with one or two senior officials. Respondents were asked to “think in terms of gender” – to consider the activities in their department from a gender perspective.

Investment Promotion Center

The Investment Promotion Center operates under the Encouragement of Capital Investments Law (1959). According to the website of the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor, this Center “encourages the establishment and expansion of industrial enterprises and structures by granting ‘approved enterprise’ status to an investment plan,” providing that 25 percent or more of its annual income comes from “sales in a specific market with at least 12 million residents” – i.e., export to a country larger than Israel. Only enterprises in National Priority Area A are eligible for “approved enterprise.” National Priority Areas are those earmarked for special treatment in order to facilitate their economic development.

In the wake of the global economic crisis, and in keeping with government decisions in 2009, the Ministry established “assistance tracks to encourage investment in the economy and the absorption of more workers” into the labor market (Ministry website). Thus, it noted, “Emphasis was placed on promoting growth and better paying jobs in the periphery by giving assistance to investors interested in establishing or expanding enterprises with better paying jobs in the periphery or moving to the periphery” (ibid).

The primary tracks are those of Grants and Employment. In 2010, The Investment Promotion Center invested some NIS 1.6 billion in these two tracks combined.

Grants Track

In the Grants Track, two huge grants were awarded – one to the Intel Corp. in Kiryat Gat for NIS 740 million, and the other to Tower Semiconductor Corporation in Migdal Ha’emek for NIS 150 million. Grants were made to an additional 173 plants for a total of NIS 531.5 million.

These grants led to the employment of 3,695 men and women.

We asked staff at the Investment Promotion Center for the breakdown of these new employees by gender and nationality, but were told they do not disaggregate the data by these categories.

Information is also not collected about the gender or nationality of the owners and managers of the companies awarded grants.

Employment Track

The Employment Track, designed to increase jobs and salary levels, has five sub-tracks: General, Judea and Samaria, Minorities, Ultra-Orthodox, and The Disabled. In 2010, a total of NIS 166 million was given in assistance to 181 companies. These grants yielded an additional 4,137 employees. As noted, the Investment Promotion Center gathers data on these new employees according to sub-tracks:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General</th>
<th>Minorities</th>
<th>Ultra-Orthodox</th>
<th>Judea and Samaria</th>
<th>Disabled</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2,261</td>
<td>1,026</td>
<td>707</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To our surprise, no record was kept of the new employees by gender. This is surprising because gender is very relevant in addressing employment problems in the ultra-Orthodox and Arab sectors. Among Arab men, 59.9 percent participate in the labor force, which is not very different from 62.4 percent of Jewish men. The lack of employment opportunities in the Arab sector pertains primarily to Arab women – only 22.5 percent of Arab women are in the labor force, compared with 58.8 percent of Jewish women (CBS, Statistical Abstract 2011). One of the objectives of the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor is to
increase the proportion of employed Arab women.

With respect to the ultra-Orthodox, the Ministry’s primary interest is to increase the proportion of employed ultra-Orthodox men, since the proportion of ultra-Orthodox women in the labor force is higher than of ultra-Orthodox men.

Clearly there is a need to collect data disaggregated by gender. Without such a breakdown, the Ministry cannot determine the extent to which it is achieving its objectives – increasing the employment of Arab women and ultra-Orthodox men. Naturally an increase in jobs for Arab men and ultra-Orthodox women also contributes new employees to the labor force and the Israeli economy, but the creation of these new jobs does not address the main problem of low workforce participation.

The Investment Promotion Center calculated the average wage of the new employees by track; the result for 2010 is as follows (the track refers to the new employees, not to the owners of the enterprise):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Track</th>
<th>Additional employees</th>
<th>Average wage of the new employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
<td>NIS 9,768</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minorities</td>
<td>NIS 7,070</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ultra-Orthodox</td>
<td>NIS 6,818</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judea and Samaria</td>
<td>NIS 6,341</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disabled</td>
<td>NIS 6,016</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data reflect significant wage gaps among new employees as a result of the assistance from the Investment Promotion Center through the Employment Track program. The following is a list of companies in which the average monthly wage of the new employees is lower than NIS 5,500, followed by a list of companies in which it is NIS 10,000 or higher.

Source: List of grantees received from the Investment Promotion Center
In light of the wage gaps evident in the above tables, the question arises: What is the average wage of men and women in each track? Based on the economic activity of the companies in question, it can be assumed that most of those paying relatively low wages employ primarily women. Obvious examples are the call centers or telemarketing companies [Call Yachol Call Center (NIS 4,805), Bezeq OnLine (NIS 5,286), S. Zaine Connection (NIS 3,953), Foxcom Group (NIS 3,953), and Arab Career (NIS 5,425)]. Another field with low wages is textiles and clothing, and here too it can be assumed that most of the employees are women (Prymtex, Magline, Carrotte, A.H. Hadeel, and Milega). Also note, though, a low average wage (NIS 4,300) paid by Tefillin for Israel Marketing Stam, in which the employees are probably men.

On the other hand, in companies offering financial or bookkeeping services, and in hi-tech – where wages are relatively higher – it can be assumed that most employees are men.

To corroborate these assumptions, a gender analysis needs to be carried out. This analysis would also answer a question not asked by the Investment Promotion Center: Do the Center’s commendable activities to increase employment and raise wages serve to narrow or increase the wage gaps between men and women, or do they have no effect on these gaps?

Another question that should be asked concerns the gender division (and nationality) of the owners of the companies awarded a grant in the employment track: Do the Center’s commendable activities serve to narrow or increase the economic power gaps between women and men in Israel (and between Jews and Arabs), or do they have no effect whatsoever on them?

We return here to the issue of interest. Not collecting data by gender stems from a lack of interest and awareness of the relevance of these data. The predominant belief is that employment equality, particularly between women and men, is a matter best left to those bodies dedicated to it such as the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission or the Prime Minister’s Advisor on the Status of Women. The strategy of gender mainstreaming contends, however, that the issue of employment equality belongs to all offices and divisions, and needs to be integral to the work of every department.
Office of the Chief Scientist

The Office of the Chief Scientist promotes government investment in research and development (R&D) for industry through grants made to companies for research or development. In its 2008 report (website), the Office of the Chief Scientist notes that this activity is necessary because market forces lead to under-investment in R&D by the companies themselves (page 8).

The Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor views the Office of the Chief Scientist as fueling economic growth. Companies may apply for support to engage in research or development, and approval is contingent upon the degree of innovation of the project (Lazanes, 2011). The Ministry also views R&D grants as a stimulant for new hirings. In 2008, the Office of the Chief Scientist had a budget of NIS 1.65 billion: 80 percent of this (NIS 1.3 billion) was used to fund the salaries of those employed in R&D, i.e., “the direct employment of approximately 15,000 workers. Research indicates that the hiring of one R&D employee leads to the hiring of another 2-3 workers in the economy.” The Office of the Chief Scientist estimates that Israel’s R&D investment in 2008 brought about the employment of 30,000-45,000 new employees (Report of the Chief Scientist, 2008: 12).

The report contains no data about the gender of those who submitted applications or were awarded grants; nor are there data about the gender of the company owners, the CEOs, or the R&D directors of the companies applying for – or those awarded – grants.

If such data were available, the Office of the Chief Scientist could have demonstrated its contribution to the integration of women into various technological fields and its contribution to enhancing the economic power of women in Israel.

Chief Scientist Grants, by Field, 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field</th>
<th>Percent of grants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Communications</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life sciences</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronics</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electro-optics</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Ms. Lydia Lazanes, Budget Officer in the Office of the Chief Scientist, who was requested to “think in terms of gender” about the work of this Office, women are quite prevalent in the life sciences and biotechnology. Women also serve as the directors of companies that receive grants and work as research scientists in these companies. Lazanes further notes that the field of biotechnology has grown rapidly in recent years: In 2000 it received only 14 percent of the grants awarded by the Office of the Chief Scientist, and currently it won 29 percent of the grants.

Dr. Orna Dar, head of the Life Sciences Department in the Office of the Chief Scientist, also “thought in terms of gender” and reported that most of the (twenty) evaluators in this field are women. These women are university graduates in the life sciences (physics, biology, chemistry, and medicine); in addition to being evaluators, they work – or have worked in the past – as directors or employees in business or at universities.

As is the case with the Investment Promotion Center – and for the same reasons – no gender data are collected in the Office of the Chief Scientist about the new employees hired as a result of the grants it provides.
Dar and Lazanes are the only women among senior staff in their ministry (Dar, 2011). This finding brings us to another subject on which a gender analysis should be conducted – the staff at the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor, by department and rank. A superficial look suggests that women generally hold management positions in fields pertaining to women, while men hold management positions in fields pertaining to the entire population. Gender equality, however, requires the presence of women at management levels in all fields.

The Regional Development Center

The Regional Development Center aims to encourage economic development in the periphery and in national priority areas in two ways: (1) by allocating state land for the construction of industrial plants and small industry (in Priority Area A) or for upgrading these plants (in Priority Areas A and B); and (2) by developing the infrastructure for new industrial parks in the periphery. Decisions about the locations of the industrial development areas are made by the government. The development itself was once carried out by four management companies, but, since 2007, it has also been done directly by some of the local authorities. Currently 70 industrial parks exist on paper. Some already constructed or in various stages of planning and construction are located in Arab and Druze towns: Abu-Snan, Aroer, Bu’eina Nujieidat, Daliat el-Carmel, Dir Hanna, Eilabun, Hura, Iksal, Ilut, Julis, Kafr Kana, Kafr Qasim, Maghar, Nazareth, Peki’in/Kisra, Qalansawe, Rahat, Rama-Sajur, Sakhnin, Shaqib al-Salam (Segev Shalom), Shefa-’Amr (Shfar’am), Tamra, Umm al-Fahm, and Yarka. Many of these are still in the initial stages of development.

According to Mr. Menahem Yehezkely, Deputy Director of the Regional Development Center, development activities in Arab locales have not led to the rise of Arab industrialists; development land has been used primarily to establish workshops for light industry or manual work.

The lack of Arab industrialists is related to the lack of opportunity for capital accrual by Arab citizens of Israel (because of their socio-economic situation) and limited financial relations with Arab citizens of other states due to the political conflict with the Palestinians. Industrial plants require a more massive investment than do workshops, and in the absence of personal capital or foreign investment, the default is the development of light industry.

Just as there are few industrialists among Arab men, there are no industrialists among women. The question arises whether the Regional Development Center can use its tools also to empower women economically.

Much attention has been given to the low proportion of Arab women in the labor market (22.5 percent in 2010). This is a problem at both the household and the national levels. For households, it is difficult to maintain a reasonable standard of living without two breadwinners. At the national level, low participation in the labor force means less purchasing power, less state income from taxes, and of course under-development of the skills of the women themselves.

One way to empower women economically is to provide them with more employment opportunities in industry. Can the benefits allocated by the Regional Development Center be used to encourage the enterprises requesting land (for industry and workshops) to ensure the employment of women – and at better wages than the current low norm (see the following section)?

Regulation and Enforcement Administration (RED)

The Regulation and Enforcement [of Labor Laws] Administration deals with complaints by workers about labor law violations; it also initiates its own investigations to determine adherence to the labor laws. The RED frequently publishes data on its activities. According to its 2010 report, it launched initiatives in many sectors: car repair shops, food services and commerce, preschool workers, hair salons, slaughterhouses in the Arab sector, hotel maintenance and services, employers of youth, and law offices. The tables in these reports record the number of cases dealt with by the RED during the course of the year, and how they were handled (files opened and closed, fines levied, indictments served, warnings issued). The report does not disaggregate by gender the complainants, the workers whose salaries or working conditions were investigated, or the employers (business owners and CEOs).

We asked Mr. Hezi Ofir, RED Director, and Ms. Ravit Tichover, Procedures
Coordinator, to “think in terms of gender.” The primary gender comment they raised in the interview was that women tend not to submit complaints, whereas men are more likely to complain about violations of their employment rights. As noted, no data are collected about the gender of the complainants, but their impression is that very few women file complaints.

Had the gender of the complainant been recorded by employment sector and labor law, analysis of the results might have enabled more effective coping with the violations. For the same reason, initiatives launched by the RED should also record the gender of the employees in question.

Another example of impressionistic data is related to the Arab sector. According to Ofir, most of those who earn less than the minimum wage are Arab women. Common violators in this category are cleaning companies and clothing manufacturers. To cope with the fact that Arab women do not file complaints, the RED recruited ten young women doing National Service and had them conduct educational activities among Arab women workers. A brochure was also issued in Arabic. Ofir explained that labor law violations are handled in criminal proceedings that require witnesses. If the women do not file complaints, violators cannot be brought to trial and punished.

The RED employs 40 inspectors, who are assisted by some 50 students. Despite the ongoing demand for more inspectors (which was also voiced in the 2011 summer protests), we believe that doubling the number of inspectors will not solve the problem. Consciousness-raising activities are needed both among the employers and the women employees, together with actions to support the women complainants and to break the silence of Arab women and their reluctance to report violations; to that end, we suggest cooperation with civil society organizations, particularly those advocating for human rights and women’s rights in the Arab sector.

Efforts should begin with data collection about the violations of workers’ rights by gender, and publication of the results.

Vocational Training Department (VTD)

The VTD is the only division serving both women and men that systematically collects data disaggregated by gender (and also nationality). Data collection by gender began in the 1990s at the initiative of Naomi Sheffer, then the official responsible for the status of women at the VTD.

The VTD subsidizes training courses for youth and adults. Subsidizing courses for adults is one of the tools used to grapple with unemployment and low wages earned by those without a profession. The budget for subsidizing adult, daytime courses was cut back drastically in the past decade; from NIS 160 million in 2000, it dropped to less than NIS 61 million in 2010, and further declined to NIS 44 million in 2011. In 2000, some 38,000 women and men enrolled in the daytime courses for adults; their numbers fell to under 5,400 in 2010. The proportion of women rose over the years, and then slightly declined. In 2010, 46 percent of the adult course participants were women; 25 percent were Arab citizens, of which 46 percent were women. Data provided by the VTD reveal that the vast majority of women in the courses learned skills regarded as women’s work – childcare (539), administration (536), beauty care (359), hospitality (241), and fashion and textiles (140). Much smaller numbers studied computers (70) and electricity or electronics (64).

The VTD also runs special professional training programs for adults: training for single parents, on-the-job training, classes with placements, business day training, and a category called “projects.” In 2010, most enrollees in the single-parent courses were women – 323 out of 338 (some 96 percent). In the on-the-job training program, 37 percent were women (33 out of 90). About half of these (17) studied industrial sewing and several studied the following professions: textile production, electronics production, quality control of chip development, warehouse administration, and telemarketing. In the classes with placements, most participants were women (78 percent, or 581 out of
748). Here too “women’s work” predominates: Of 581 women training for placement, 172 were studying to be caregivers in daycare centers; 84 were studying integrated administration, and 56 were studying bookkeeping. The labor market is in need of women in these fields, and the programs meet the market needs. At the same time, the data do not suggest an effort to enable these women to work in the new and better paying professions.

Because professions considered “women’s jobs” pay a lower wage than other jobs, it would make sense for the VTD to use the tools at its disposal to encourage women to enter professions in which wages are higher – such as computers and electronics.

Programs to Encourage Employment of Single Parents, 45+ Year-Olds, and Ethiopian Israelis

These programs are not in the budget book of the Ministry. According to Mr. David Steinmetz, head of budgets and programs, funding for these programs is allocated during the course of the fiscal year. To learn about these programs, we interviewed Ms. Tzipi Shankman, Program Director, and Ms. Keren Sa’adon, Project Manager.

The responsibility for programs for single parents (mostly women) was assigned to Shankman in 2009. Unlike the “Wisconsin Plan,” these programs are voluntary. Shankman notes that the program tools include employment diagnostics, upgrading through professional training, full reimbursement of travel expenses for occupational training, enlarged subsidies for infant and childcare for the children of program participants, and a special budget for childcare during the summer months and holidays.

The program targets women, of course, unlike the programs aimed at individuals aged 45 or older. The latter is a newer program and includes the option of completing an education and entrepreneurship training. There is no breakdown by gender of those participating in the program designed for 45+ year-olds. Had a gender analysis been conducted, the program organizers might have discovered that the men and women in this program have different needs. For example, a large number of the men in the program may have left senior positions. In contrast, a large number of the women may not have previously worked outside the home. Thus, the men and women would require different types of services. Collection of data by gender and an analysis of the characteristics of each gender group would enhance the effectiveness of the program.

This principle is also true of the programs designed for Ethiopian Israelis.
Summary and Conclusions

The Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor should collect data disaggregated by gender so that its activities are more transparent and better serve the needs of both women and men. Furthermore, the law mandates the collection of gender statistics.

Another reason to collect data by gender is the contribution this could make to increased equality between women and men by enhancing the economic power of women. The source of the demand to collect gender-based data is the inequality that prevails between women and men.

The Ministry is equipped with a variety of tools that could serve to raise the status of women in Israel. All that is required is the desire and the will to do so.

Resources

Investment Promotion Center, Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor, “Statistical Presentation for the Minister.”
Investment Promotion Center, website of the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Labor.

Interviews

Mr. Hezi Zaieg and Mr. Elli Gershenkroin, Investment Promotion Center, May 18, 2011.
Ms. Lydia Lazanes, Office of the Chief Scientist, June 22, 2011.
Mr. David Steinmetz, Budgets and Programming, June 22, 2011.
Dr. Ora Dar, Office of the Chief Scientist, August 8, 2011.
Mr. Hezi Ofir and Ms. Ravit Tichover, Department of Enforcement of Labor Laws, July 24, 2011.
Ms. Tsipi Sheinkman and Ms. Keren Sa’adon, August 28, 2011.
Mr. Menachem Yecheskely, Regional Development Center, October 26, 2011.
This publication was made possible thanks to the support and partnership of the following organizations:
Heinrich Boell Stiftung, European Union and The Hadassah Foundation

The document itself was produced with the financial assistance of the Heinrich Boell Stiftung and the European Union. However, the contents of this document are the sole responsibility of the Adva Center and can under no circumstances be regarded as reflecting the position of the partner organizations.

The Hadassah Foundation awarded seed money to the Women’s Budget Forum and has provided support ever since. However, it bears no responsibility for the contents of this document.